**REPORT**

**OF INQUIRY CONDUCTED ON 11 JUNE, 2013 AT MULTAN**

The Chief Operating Officer, PCB was pleased to order inquiry in the matter of 05 women cricketers whereby in program namely **“*Takrar*”** of Express News TV Channel telecasted on **7th** **June, 2013** at 10 PM; they alleged sexual harassment against the management of Multan Cricket Club affiliated with Pakistan Cricket Board.

Following comprised of the inquiry committee:

1. **Ms. Ayesha Ashhar** – Manager Women Cricket, PCB
2. **Mr. Mauhtashim Rasheed** – Coach National Women Team, PCB

**Mr. Shahbaz Ali Rizvi, Advocate Supreme Court, Partner Rizvi & Rizvi ® Advocates** assisted the Committee on legal matters.

**SUMMARY OF EVENTS:**

In the program namely **“Takrar”** telecasted on Express News on **7 June,** **2013** five Women Cricketers from Multan Region namely Seema Javed, Hina Ghafoor, Saba Ghafoor, Kiran Irshad and Haleema Rafique (hereinafter collectively referred to as “the Players”) leveled allegations of unfair treatment and sexual harassment against Ms. Shami Soltan, Honorary PCB Regional Women Representative and the management of Multan Cricket Club comprising of Molvi Sultan Alam, Mr. Javed and Agha Ihtasham.

The Players are affiliated with **Multan Cricket** Club and play cricket [regularly/intermittently]. The said Club is registered with DCA Multan, therefore the rules, regulations pertaining to disciplinary and all other matters and any directions issued from time to time by PCB are applicable to the Club and its members and affiliates. Accordingly, in case of any complaint against the Club management, the players are required to approach their Regional Cricket Association or the District Cricket Association, as the case may be or in the alternate Pakistan Cricket Board (PCB) – the parent organization established under **SRO No.100 (I) 2013**.

PCB took a serious note of such media allegations and to probe into the matter, this Inquiry Committee was constituted which conducted the instant inquiry.

**INQUIRY CONDUCTED AT MULTAN:**

1. The Players who participated in the supra referred TV program were telephonically informed about the inquiry, its time and venue to ensure their presence. Similarly, the supra referred members of Multan Cricket Club Management, to appear before the Inquiry Committee on **11 June, 2013**.
2. Seema Javed
3. Hina Ghafoor
4. Kiran Irshad
5. Saba Ghafoor
6. Haleema Rafiq

*Following members of MCC management were called in the manner as aforesaid.*

1. Mrs Shami Soltan, Honorary PCB Regional Women Representative
2. Maulvi Mohammad Soltan Alam Ansari, Chairman MCC
3. Agha Ehtisham, Manager Administration MCC
4. Javed Ahmed, Captain MCC

1. Out the five Players who appeared in TV program and were called in the inquiry, despite notice only three players appeared in person before the Committee:

**Players:**

1. Seema Javed
2. Hina Ghafoor
3. Kiran Irshad

**Members of Multan Cricket Club (MCC) Management who appeared:**

1. Mrs Shami Soltan, Honorary PCB Regional Women Representative
2. Maulvi Mohammad Soltan Alam Ansari, Chairman MCC
3. Agha Ehtisham, Manager Administration MCC
4. Javed Ahmed, Captain MCC

1. The Players were called in individually and separately and interviewed/questioned by committee, their statements were recorded on oath, and they were provided the same in writing to read and confirm followed by obtaining signature and thumb impression. Each player, upon conclusion of her statement was asked if she has to say anything else – each one of them replied in negative.
2. The members of the MCC management submitted their statements in writing which are attached as **Annexure ‘B’**.

**OBSERVATIONS OF INQUIRY COMMITTEE:**

**Statements of Players:**

The Committee has carefully reviewed the statements given by the Players and filed by the members of management of MCC, after which our findings are as follows:

1. None of the Players stated on Oath alleged that they were harassed by any member of MCC management in any way.
2. Instead Hina Ghafoor candidly admitted that ban was imposed against her by Honorary Rep **Begum Shami Soltan**. She also admitted that due to her being banned, she was not allowed to play or participate in the game at different fora. She clearly stated that she does not have any other complaint against anybody. It may be noted that in her statement on Oath, she did not complain nor referred any sexual harassment. Hina Ghafoor’s statement is attached as **Annexure ‘A’**.
3. Seema Javed admitted that she was not allowed to play because of the ban imposed by Begum Shami Sultan Honorary Rep Multan Region. She also admitted that there was a complaint against her regarding *“misbehavior and misconduct against Islamabad Team manager”* and that she had, in past, tendered an apology regarding some *“incident”*. She did not allege sexual harassment against any person. Seema Javed’s statement is attached as **Annexure ‘B’**.
4. Kiran Irshad unequivocally stated that she has *“no complain against anybody”*, she has *“not seen anything”* and she does not *“want to say anything more”*. Kiran Irshad’s statement is attached as **Annexure ‘C’**.

**Members of Management of MCC**

1. Maulvi Mohammad Soltan Alam Ansari, Chairman MCC submitted his statement in writing wherein he states that;
   1. the *“program prepared by the Express News Channel … is malicious and has been concocted under a well thought scheme”*, *“Seema Javed was banned from entering MCC Club on 12-01-2012”,*
   2. *“Kiran Irshad was caught red handed with a drink mixed with alcohol … Because of this serious violation of discipline she was expelled from the camp and was blacklisted by the then management.”*
   3. *“Hina Ghafoor and Saba Ghafoor … used to carry lady players with them to outstations and also used to collect contributions from rich persons around of the city and thus make money… both were banned from entering the Government College…”*

Maulvi Mohammad Soltan Alam Ansari’s statement is attached as **Annexure ‘D’**.

1. Mrs Shami Soltan, Honorary PCB Regional Women Representative stated that *“these girls were involved in objectionable activities … for which proof was submitted and Ms. Ayesha Ashhar was informed*

Mrs Shami Soltan’s statement is attached as **Annexure ‘E’**.

1. Agha Ehtisham Hussain Khan, Manager Administration MCC gave his statement in Urdu which is translated to the following effect:

*“During this long duration until today no women cricketer has ever complained against any member of MCC Management, coach, Captain or player.”*

*“Under MCC Regulations any person whether a man or a women [if] violates discipline or has a dubious character, is neither permitted to enter the club nor he/she can do net practice. Due to the said accusation being proved, Seema Javed, Kiran Irshad, Hina Ghafoor, Saba Ghafoor were barred from practicing and entering the club.”*

*“Seema Javed along with her elder sister and brothers was involved in a heinous criminal case ... Seema’s Sister remained incarcerated for a long time in the said case…”*

*“Seema Javed along with her brother obtained food from MCC canteen in the name of senior member but did not pay. On being asked for payment she replied that chairman of the club would pay. Similarly she took her sister’s laptop for repair at Younus Janju’s workshop in Multan Cantt. Regarding Bill she told him that MCC Management would pay. Further from MCC Nursery she bought flowers but did not pay. Due to all these reason around two and a half years back she was barred from entering the club and net practicing.”*

His statement contains similar allegations about Kiran Irshad’s drinking and Hina Ghafoor and Saba Ghafoor organizing Women Cricket tournaments to collect money.

Agha Ehtisham Hussain Khan’s statement is attached as **Annexure ‘F’**.

1. Javed Ahmed, Captain MCC submitted his statement to the following effect.

*“The Club administration imposed ban on Seema Javed, Kiran Irshad, Saba Ghafoor and Hina Ghafoor to enter or play [in the club] because all of them violated discipline, club regulations and the principles of PCB.”*

*“These four women were tarnishing the reputation of the club; against Seema Javed, a criminal case was also registered against her about which news were being published in newspapers. She submitted several apologies and starting playing again but even then she continued with her bad deeds.”*

*“Kiran Irshad was caught consuming alcohol drinking because of which she was banned from entering the club and doing net practice.”*

*“Hina Ghafoor and Saba Ghafoor used to collect money from Multan and adjoining areas by arranging women [cricket] tournaments. PCB required explanation from MCC and prohibited arranging tournaments without seeking permission. MCC administration stopped them from using their ground and sought PCB permission because of which the said women turned against us and established an NGO and a cricket club for lobbying”*

*“These women managed to get news published in newspapers that very soon PCB will change the Multan Women Wing management…”*

Javed Ahmed’s statement is attached as **Annexure ‘G’**.

**WITNESSES:**

Following appeared and filed statements in writing on behalf of MCC.

A - MCC OFFICIALS

1. Statement dated 10-06-2013 of Mazhar Khan Tareen, General Secretary MCC
2. Statement dated 10-06-2013 of Humayun Muzammil, Vice President MCC
3. Statement dated 08-06-2013 of Riaz Ahmad, Coach MCC
4. Statement dated 11-06-2013 of Shabana Yasmin, Manager Women Cricket Team
5. Statement dated 11-06-2013 of Meraj Fatima, Hostel Warden

The statements are attached as **Annexure ‘H/1 to H/5’**.

B - WOMEN CRICKETERS/WARDEN OF WOMEN HOSTEL

Following players and warden of Aligarh School Multan Hostels appeared as witnesses and gave on Oath statements in favor of MCC administration.

1. Areeb Shamaim (Player)
2. Razia Kalsoom (Player)
3. Madiha Rehman (Player)
4. Sukhan Faiz (Player)
5. Nadia Hussain (Player)
6. Lila Aziz Khan (Player)
7. Asma Bano (Player)
8. Fakhra Kazmi (Player)
9. Sana Gulzar (Player)
10. Shabana Yasmin (Player)
11. Nazia Insad (Player)
12. Hina Insad (Player)
13. Fatima Rizvi (Warden, Aligarh School Multan Hostels)

The statements are attached as **Annexure ‘I/1 to I/13’**.

C - REGISTERED CRICKET CLUBS OF MULTAN

1. Resolution dated 10-06-2013 passed by Crescent Cricket Club, Multan against the Players
2. Statement dated 09-06-2013 of Malik Amjad Razzaq Bhutta, President Multan Youngsters Cricket Club
3. Statement dated 10-06-2013 of Muhammad Younus Ansari, President Pioneer Cricket Club Multan
4. Statement/Resolution dated 10-06-2013 of Habib Hassan, President Multan Gymkhana Cricket Club
5. Statement dated nil of Malik Muhammad Asghar, Selector of Qureshi Cricket Club Multan
6. Statement dated nil of Tariq Rafiq, General Secretary Muslim Gymkhana Cricket Club Multan
7. Statement dated nil of Sadaqat Ali Qureshi, General Secretary A.O Cricket Club Multan
8. Statement dated nil of Zohaib Malik, General Secretary Awalin Sports Cricket Club Multan
9. Statement dated nil of Muhammad Irfan Yousuf, General Secretary Awalin Youngster Cricket Club

The statements are attached as **Annexure ‘J/1 to J/9’**.

D - OUTSIDERS HAVING NO CONNECTION WITH MCC

1. Syed Zohaib Ali Naqvi – comes to walk in club and play cricket
2. Shah Rukh bin Saeed – comes to walk in club and play cricket
3. Nafs Haider – comes to walk in club and play cricket
4. Syed Aun Muhammad – comes to walk in club and play cricket
5. Syed Rashid Naseem Rizvi – comes to walk in club and play cricket

The statements are attached as **Annexure ‘K/1 to K/5’**.

**DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE**

1. Statement dated 24-01-2012 of Arooj
2. Statement dated nil of Kiran Irshad
3. News extract from Urdu Daily Khabrain dated 12-11-2012
4. News extract from Urdu Daily Naya Akhbar dated 05-05-2013
5. News extract from Urdu Daily Khabrain dated 07-05-2013
6. News extract from Urdu Daily Jang dated 07-05-2013
7. Written apology dated nil of Seema Javed in Urdu and English (received sometime in 2009 as indicated by seal)
8. Written apology dated 21-07-2010 of Seema Javed
9. News extract dated 19-12-2011 from Urdu Daily Khabrain
10. Copy of FIR No.1403 dated 31-12-2012 (Acquittal Order dated 04-07-2012 of ASJ Multan)
11. News extracts from Urdu Daily Nawa-e-Waqt dated 03-01-2011 and 07-01-2012
12. News extract from Urdu Daily Jhang dated 19-12-2011

The documents are attached as **Annexure ‘L/1 to L/12’**.

Statements of cricketers as documentary evidence

1. Statement dated 08-06-2013 of Sukhan Faiz
2. Statement dated 08-06-2013 of Areeb Shamaim
3. Statement dated nil of Nadia Hussain
4. Statement dated nil of Fakhra Kazmi
5. Statement dated 08-06-2013 of Asma Bano
6. Statement dated nil of Laila Aziz
7. Statement dated nil of Madiha Rehman
8. Statement dated 11-06-2013 of Sana Gulzar
9. Statement dated nil of Sania Khan
10. Statement dated 10-06-2013 of Asmavia Iqbal Khokhar
11. Statement dated 11-06-2013 of Razia Kulsoom

The statements are attached as **Annexure ‘M/1 to M/11’**.

**OBSERVATIONS OF INQUIRY COMMITTEE**

After examining the contents of the program “*Takrar*” (hereinafter referred to as the “TV program”) which was telecasted on **7th June, 2013**, the interviews/statements given by the Players and the statements in writing by the MCC Managements, we have following observations:

1. In the said TV program, the allegations leveled by the Players pertain primarily to the sexual harassment but one way or the other their accusations always ended up regarding selection in team and merit. The general attitude and demeanor of the Players during the TV program and the interviews raises questions about their own mental caliber.
2. It was admitted by the some of the Players during interview/recording of statement by the Inquiry Committee that she was banned by MCC. Several witnesses who appeared on behalf of MCC gave statements to the said effect; this seems to be the real bone of contention.
3. Having giving the above observations about the Players, we observe that we are not fully satisfied with the attitude and manner in MCC management handled the matter. It will not be appropriate to accuse only the Players of unauthorized and inappropriate conduct. The management including Maulvi Mohammad Soltan Alam Ansari, Chairman MCC and Mr. Javed Ahmed, Captain MCC also appeared on the TV program in order to justify accusations against them. Such appearances unless a written permission is obtained from PCB, are not allowed and should be discouraged.
4. Further, in the TV program it was alleged and the MCC management admitted that they have a snooker area, restaurant and other commercial activities going on with MCC premises. While it is logical for a club to have on its premises a canteen, gym or to allow some commercial activity due to which the club earns income but it does not appear to be consistent with the objects of the club to have a snooker playing area which is used by general public, or the restaurant/canteen is used by general public. We are also unable to understand the establishment of plants nursery in the club.
5. With regard to the allegations of sexual harassment which were leveled in the TV program, the Players did not utter a single word rather before the Inquiry Committee all their assertions revolved around selection in team/tournaments, clarifications about the ban imposed by MCC, and/or provision of net practice. They also reiterate that they have no complaint against anybody and they have not seen anything.
6. During the inquiry and even after that the club management failed to bring on record any “ban” which allegedly had been imposed against the Players. However, the ban not being denied by the Players, non-productions has no value.
7. We also take notice of the some of the players alleged that they were threatened not to appear before the inquiry committee and participate in the inquiry. As a proof, Seema Javed showed the Committee a text message received on her cell phone from the **03336078880** which she claimed belonged to **Ms. Sania Khan** (Multan Player)
8. While the observations against MCC management do not render the Players as innocent but the number of witnesses which even includes the “passersby” (along with club players) is noteworthy, all of which gave statements and affidavits in more or less similar words against the Players.

**RECOMMENDATIONS:**

In view of the above details of facts and observations, we believe that the players as well as the club management need to seriously reflect on their actions. The Players who during the TV program raised allegations of sexual harassment against the club management did not utter a single word during the inquiry in the same terms and manner of the TV program whereas the club management in its zeal to prove its innocence even produced the statements of the strangers in their favor. Accordingly, for failing to prove sexual harassment by the management we recommend that the Players namely Seema Javed, Hina Ghafoor, Kiran Irshad should be severely reprimanded for their acts and misplaced and motivated interaction with media whereby they accused Club officials; additionally, they will also remain under observation for a period of one year. Similarly, Saba Ghafoor and Haleema Rafiq who although appeared on TV program and were duly informed about the inquiry but failed to appear and shall undergo the same censure.

As for the club management a letter of censure should be written to them with its copy to the concerned District Cricket Association which should be ordered to monitor the club’s activities closely and report to Director Domestic Cricket Operations quarterly.

We also strongly recommend that the district cricket associations should be issued special directions to ensure that the clubs registered with them follow the regulations and disciplinary procedures of PCB in letter and spirit so as to avoid such uncalled for, unprofessional event(s) which not only violates the spirit of the game but also tarnish the image of the game of cricket.

Members: of the Inquiry Committee

1. **Ayesha Ashhar** \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
2. **Mauhtashim Rasheed**  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Dated: